On approximation of real, complex, and p-adic numbers by algebraic numbers of bounded degree

BY

K. I. TSISHCHANKA

I. On approximation by rational numbers

THEOREM 1 (Dirichlet, 1842). For any real irrational number ξ there exist infinitely many rational numbers p/q such that

$$\left|\xi - \frac{p}{q}\right| < \frac{1}{q^2}.$$

Example: Let $\xi = e$. Consider the continued fraction expansion:



We have

$$2 + \frac{1}{1} = 3 \qquad 2 + \frac{1}{1 + \frac{1}{2}} = \frac{8}{3} \qquad 2 + \frac{1}{1 + \frac{1}{2 + \frac{1}{1}}} = \frac{11}{4}$$



$\delta_0 = 2$	e - 2 < 1
$\delta_1 = 3$	e-3 < 1
$\delta_2 = \frac{8}{3}$	$\left e - \frac{8}{3}\right < \frac{1}{3^2}$
$\delta_3 = \frac{11}{4}$	$\left e - \frac{11}{4}\right < \frac{1}{4^2}$
$\delta_4 = \frac{19}{7}$	$\left e - \frac{19}{7}\right < \frac{1}{7^2}$
$\delta_5 = \frac{87}{32}$	$\left e - \frac{87}{32} \right < \frac{1}{32^2}$
$\delta_6 = \frac{106}{39}$	$\left e - \frac{106}{39} \right < \frac{1}{39^2}$
$\delta_7 = \frac{193}{71}$	$\left e - \frac{193}{71} \right < \frac{1}{71^2}$
$\delta_8 = \frac{1264}{465}$	$\left e - \frac{1264}{465} \right < \frac{1}{465^2}$
$\delta_9 = \frac{1457}{536}$	$\left e - \frac{1457}{536} \right < \frac{1}{536^2}$
$\delta_{10} = \frac{2721}{1001}$	$\left e - \frac{2721}{1001} \right < \frac{1}{1001^2}$



THEOREM 2. For any real irrational number ξ there exist infinitely many rational numbers p/q such that

$$\left|\xi - \frac{p}{q}\right| < \frac{1}{2q^2}.$$

$\delta_0 = 2$	e - 2 < 1
$\delta_{1}=3$	$ e-3 < rac{1}{\sqrt{5}\cdot 1^2}$
$\delta_{2}={f 8\over 3}$	$\left e-rac{8}{3} ight <rac{1}{2\cdot 3^2}$
$\delta_3 = \frac{11}{4}$	$\left e - \frac{11}{4}\right < \frac{1}{4^2}$
$\delta_{f 4}={f 19\over 7}$	$\left e-\frac{19}{7}\right <\frac{1}{\sqrt{5}\cdot7^2}$
$\delta_5={f 87\over 32}$	$\left e-\frac{87}{32}\right <\frac{1}{2\cdot 32^2}$
$\delta_6 = \frac{106}{39}$	$\left e - \frac{106}{39} \right < \frac{1}{39^2}$
$\delta_7 = \frac{193}{71}$	$\left e-\frac{193}{71}\right <\frac{1}{\sqrt{5}\cdot71^2}$
$\delta_8=\frac{1264}{465}$	$\left e-\frac{1264}{465}\right <\frac{1}{2\cdot465^2}$
$\delta_9 = \frac{1457}{536}$	$\left e - \frac{1457}{536} \right < \frac{1}{536^2}$
s 2721	$\begin{vmatrix} 2721 \end{vmatrix}$ 1

 $\delta_{10} = \frac{2721}{1001} \qquad \qquad \left| e - \frac{2721}{1001} \right| < \frac{1}{\sqrt{5} \cdot 1001^2}$

THEOREM 3 (Hurwitz). For any real irrational number ξ there exist infinitely many rational numbers p/q such that

$$\left|\xi - \frac{p}{q}\right| < \frac{1}{\sqrt{5q^2}}.$$

This result is the best possible.

Example:



II. Polynomial Interpretation

For any real irrational number ξ there exist infinitely many rational numbers p/q such that

$$\begin{vmatrix} \xi - \frac{p}{q} \end{vmatrix} < \frac{1}{q^2}.$$
$$\Downarrow$$
$$|q\xi - p| < q^{-1}.$$

THEOREM 4. For any real irrational number ξ there exist infinitely many polynomials $P \in \mathbb{Z}[x]$ of the first degree such that

$$|P(\xi)| \ll \overline{P}|^{-1},$$

where |P| denotes the height of the polynomial P, that is the maximum of absolute values of its coefficients, \ll is the Vinogradov symbol.

THEOREM 5. For any real number $\xi \notin \mathbb{A}_n$ there exist infinitely many polynomials $P \in \mathbb{Z}[x]$ of degree $\leq n$ such that

$$|P(\xi)| \ll \overline{P}|^{-n},$$

where A_n is the set of real algebraic numbers of degree $\leq n$.



III. Conjecture of Wirsing

CONJECTURE (WIRSING, 1961). For any real number $\xi \notin \mathbb{A}_n$, there exist infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha \in \mathbb{A}_n$ with

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-n-1+\epsilon}, \quad \epsilon > 0,$$

where $H(\alpha)$ is the height of α .

Further W. M. Schmidt conjectured that the exponent

 $-n-1+\epsilon$

can be replaced even by

$$-n - 1$$
.



At the moment this Conjecture is proved only for

$$n = 1 \quad \Rightarrow \quad |\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-2} \quad \text{(Dirichlet, 1842)}$$

$$n = 2 \quad \Rightarrow \quad |\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-3} \quad \text{(Davenport - Schmidt, 1967)}$$

$$n > 2 \quad \Rightarrow \quad ???$$

Consider the polynomial

$$P(x) = a_n x^n + \ldots + a_1 x + a_0 = a_n (x - \alpha_1) \cdot \ldots \cdot (x - \alpha_n).$$

Without loss of generality we can assume that α_1 is the root of P(x) closest to ξ . We have

$$|\xi - \alpha_1| \ll \frac{|P(\xi)|}{|P'(\xi)|}.$$

By Theorem 3 there are infinitely many polynomials $P \in \mathbbm{z}[x]$ of degree $\leq n$ such that

$$|P(\xi)| \ll |P|^{-n}.$$

Let n = 1. Then

$$|P'(\xi)| = |a_1| \asymp \overline{P} \quad \Rightarrow \quad |\xi - \alpha_1| \ll \frac{\overline{P}}{|P|} = \overline{P}^{-2}$$

Let n = 2. Then for some $\delta \leq 1$

$$|P'(\xi)| = |2a_2\xi + a_1| \asymp |P|^{\delta} \Rightarrow |\xi - \alpha_1| \ll \frac{|P|^{-2}}{|P|^{\delta}} = |P|^{-2-\delta}$$
???

<u>QUESTION</u>: Can one prove that the following is impossible: All polynomials with $|P(\xi)| \ll \overline{P}^{-n}$ have a "small" derivative $|P'(\xi)| \asymp \overline{P}^{\delta}, \ \delta < 1$.

<u>ANSWER</u>: Yes, for n=1 (Dirichlet, 1842) n=2 (Davenport – Schmidt, 1967)

IV. Theorem of Wirsing

THEOREM 6 (Wirsing, 1961). For any real number $\xi \notin \mathbb{A}_n$ there exist infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha \in \mathbb{A}_n$ with

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n}{2} - \lambda_n}, \quad \lim_{n \to \infty} \lambda_n = 2.$$

By Dirichlet's Box principle there are infinitely polynomials

$$P(x) = a_n(x - \alpha_1) \cdot \ldots \cdot (x - \alpha_n)$$

such that

$$|P(\xi)| \ll \overline{P}|^{-n},$$

therefore

$$|\xi - \alpha_1| \cdot \ldots \cdot |\xi - \alpha_n| \ll \overline{P}^{-n} a_n^{-1}.$$

Even if $a_n = |\overline{P}|$, we can only prove that

$$|\xi - \alpha_1| \cdot \ldots \cdot |\xi - \alpha_n| \ll \overline{P}^{-n-1} \ll H(\alpha_1)^{-n-1},$$

$$\Downarrow$$

$$|\xi - \alpha_1| \ll H(\alpha_1)^{-\frac{n+1}{n}} ???$$

It is also clear, that the worth case for us is when

$$|\xi - \alpha_1| = \ldots = |\xi - \alpha_n|.$$

QUESTION:Can one prove that for infinitely many polynomials $P \in \mathbb{Z}[x]$ with $|P(\xi)| \ll \overline{P}^{-n}$ the situation $|\xi - \alpha_1| = \ldots = |\xi - \alpha_n|$ is impossible?

<u>ANSWER</u>: For infinitely many polynomials $P \in \mathbb{Z}[x]$ with $|P(\xi)| \ll \overline{|P|^{-n}}$ we have: $|\xi - \alpha_1| \ll |\xi - \alpha_2| \ll 1$, $|\xi - \alpha_3|, \dots, |\xi - \alpha_n|$ are "big".

Step 1: Construct ∞ -many $P, Q \in \mathbb{Z}[x], \deg P, Q \leq n$, such that



Step 2. Consider the resultant of P, Q:

$$R(P,Q) = a_m^{\ell} b_\ell^m \prod_{1 \le i,j \le n} (\alpha_i - \beta_j).$$

On the one hand,

 $R(P,Q)\neq 0,$

since P, Q have no common root. Moreover,

 $R(P,Q)\in\mathbb{Z},$

since P, Q have integer coefficients.

Therefore we get

 $|R(P,Q)| \ge 1.$

Step 3. On the other hand,

$$\begin{aligned} |R(P,Q)| &= a_m^{\ell} b_{\ell}^m \prod_{1 \le i,j \le n} |\alpha_i - \beta_j| \\ &\ll |\overline{P}|^{2n} \prod_{1 \le i,j \le n} |\alpha_i - \beta_j| \\ &\ll |\overline{P}|^{2n} \prod_{1 \le i,j \le n} \max(|\xi - \alpha_i|, |\xi - \beta_j|). \end{aligned}$$

$$|\xi - \alpha_1| = \dots = |\xi - \alpha_n| \ll \overline{P}|^{-1 - \frac{1}{n}},$$

 $|\xi - \beta_1| = \dots = |\xi - \beta_n| \ll \overline{P}|^{-1 - \frac{1}{n}},$

then

$$|R(P,Q)| \ll \overline{|P|^{2n}} \overline{|P|^{(-1-\frac{1}{n})n^2}} = \overline{|P|^{n-n^2}} < 1,$$

which contradicts to Step 2.

LEMMA (Wirsing, 1961):

$$|\xi - \gamma| \ll \max \begin{cases} |P(\xi)|^{\frac{1}{2}} |Q(\xi)| \overline{P}|^{n - \frac{3}{2}}, \\ |P(\xi)| |Q(\xi)|^{\frac{1}{2}} \overline{P}|^{n - \frac{3}{2}}, \end{cases}$$

where γ is a root of P or Q closest to ξ . Since

$$|P(\xi)| \ll \overline{P}|^{-n},$$
$$|Q(\xi)| \ll \overline{Q}|^{-n},$$

we get

$$|\xi - \gamma| \ll |P|^{-\frac{n}{2} - n + n - \frac{3}{2}} = |P|^{-\frac{n}{2} - \frac{3}{2}}.$$

V. "Big Derivative" Method

THEOREM 7 (Bernik-Tsishchanka, 1993). For any real number $\xi \notin \mathbb{A}_n$ there exist infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha \in \mathbb{A}_n$ with

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n}{2} - \lambda_n}, \quad \lim_{n \to \infty} \lambda_n = 3.$$

The following table contains the values of

$$\frac{n}{2} + \lambda_n$$

corresponding to Wirsing's Theorem (1961), the Theorem of Bernik-Tsishchanka (1993), and the Conjecture:

n	1961	1993	Conj.
3	3.28	3.5	4
4	3.82	4.12	5
5	4.35	4.71	6
6	4.87	5.28	7
7	5.39	5.84	8
8	5.9	6.39	9
9	6.41	6.93	10
10	6.92	7.47	11
15	9.44	10.09	16
20	11.95	12.67	21
50	26.98	27.84	51
100	51.99	52.92	101

Fix some H > 0. By Dirichlet's Box Principle there exists an integer polynomial P such that

$$|a_n| \ll H, \dots, |a_2| \ll H, |a_1| \ll H^{1+\epsilon}, |a_0| \ll H^{1+\epsilon},$$

 $|P(\xi)| \ll H^{-n-\epsilon},$ (1)

where $\epsilon > 0$. We now consider two cases:

Case A: Let

$$\max(|a_1|, |a_0|) \gg H,$$

that is

$$\max(|a_1|, |a_0|) = H^{1+\delta} = |P|, \qquad 0 < \delta \le \epsilon.$$

It is clear that in this case the derivative of P is "big", that is

$$|P'(\xi)| \asymp H^{1+\delta}.$$
 (2)

We have the following well-known inequality

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll \frac{|P(\xi)|}{|P'(\xi)|},\tag{3}$$

•

where α is the root of the polynomial P closest to ξ . Substituting (1) and (2) into (3), we get

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll \frac{H^{-n-\epsilon}}{H^{1+\delta}} = H^{-(1+\delta)\frac{n+1+\epsilon+\delta}{1+\delta}} = \overline{P}^{-\frac{n+1+\epsilon+\delta}{1+\delta}} \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n+1+2\epsilon}{1+\epsilon}}$$

Case B: Let

 $\max(|a_1|, |a_0|) \ll H,$

then

$$\overline{P} \ll H. \tag{4}$$

Using Dirichlet's Box we construct an integer polynomial Q such that

$$|b_n| \ll H, \dots, |b_2| \ll H, |b_1| \ll H^{1+\epsilon}, |b_0| \ll H^{1+\epsilon},$$

 $|Q(\xi)| \ll H^{-n-\epsilon},$ (5)

If $\max(|b_1|, |b_0|) \gg H$, then

$$|\xi - \beta| \ll H(\beta)^{-\frac{n+1+2\epsilon}{1+\epsilon}}$$

If $\max(|b_1|, |b_0|) \ll H$, then

$$\overline{Q} \ll H. \tag{6}$$

Then we can apply Wirsing's Lemma:

$$|\xi - \gamma| \ll \max \left\{ \begin{array}{l} |P(\xi)|^{\frac{1}{2}} |Q(\xi)| \overline{|P|^{n-\frac{3}{2}}}, \\ |P(\xi)| |Q(\xi)|^{\frac{1}{2}} \overline{|P|^{n-\frac{3}{2}}}, \end{array} \right.$$

Substituting (4), (5), (6), and $|P(\xi)| \ll H^{-n-\epsilon}$, we get:

$$|\xi - \gamma| \ll H^{-\frac{n}{2} - \frac{3}{2} - \frac{3}{2}\epsilon} \ll H(\gamma)^{-\frac{n}{2} - \frac{3}{2} - \frac{3}{2}\epsilon}.$$

Let us compare estimates in the Case A and Case B:

Case A:
$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n+1+2\epsilon}{1+\epsilon}}$$

Case B: $|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n}{2}-\frac{3}{2}-\frac{3}{2}\epsilon}$

If we take $\epsilon = 0$, then

Case A:
$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-n-1}$$

Case B: $|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n}{2}-\frac{3}{2}}$

On the other hand, if we take $\epsilon = 2$, then

Case A:
$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n+5}{3}}$$

Case B: $|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n}{2}-4.5}$

Finally, if we choose an optimal value of $\epsilon,$ namely

$$\epsilon = 1 - \frac{6}{n},$$

we obtain

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-n/2+\lambda_n}, \quad \lim_{n \to \infty} \lambda_n = 3,$$

in both cases.

VI. "Improvement"

Let us consider an integer polynomial P such that

$$|a_n| \ll H, \dots, |a_2| \ll H^{1+\epsilon}, |a_1| \ll H^{1+\epsilon}, |a_0| \ll H^{1+\epsilon},$$

 $|P(\xi)| \ll H^{-n-2\epsilon}.$

We have

Case A:
$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n+1+3\epsilon}{1+\epsilon}}$$

Case B: $|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n}{2}-\frac{3}{2}-3\epsilon}$.

Put

$$\epsilon = 1 - \frac{10}{n},$$

then

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-n/2+\lambda_n}, \quad \lim_{n \to \infty} \lambda_n = 4.5,$$

in both cases.

However, the Case A does not work. In fact,

$$\max(|a_2|, |a_1|, |a_0|) \gg H \quad \not\Rightarrow \quad |P'(\xi)| \quad \text{is "big"}.$$

VII. Method of "Polynomial Staircase"

In 1996 a new approach to this problem was introduced:

Step 1. Let $R^{(k)}$ be a polynomial with k "big" coefficients. We construct the following n polynomials

$$Q^{(3)}, \ldots, Q^{(n+1)}, P^{(n+1)},$$

which are small at ξ .

Step 2. We prove that they are linearly independent.

Step 3. Using a linear combination of these polynomials, we construct the polynomial

$$L^{(2)} = d_1 Q^{(3)} + \ldots + d_{n-1} Q^{(n+1)} + d_n P^{(n+1)}$$

with two "big" coefficients. The Case A does work for L. Moreover, it is possible to show that an influence of the numbers d_1, \ldots, d_n is very weak, so

$$|L(\xi)| \ll H^{-n-2\epsilon}.$$

This method allows us to prove the following

THEOREM 8. For any real number $\xi \notin \mathbb{A}_n$ there exist infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha \in \mathbb{A}_n$ with

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n}{2} - \lambda_n}, \quad \lim_{n \to \infty} \lambda_n = 4.$$

The following table contains the values of

$$\frac{n}{2} + \lambda_n$$

corresponding to Wirsing's Theorem (1961), the Theorem of Bernik-Tsishchanka (1993), Theorem 8 (2001), and the Conjecture:

n	1961	1993	2001	Conj.
3	3.28	3.5	3.73	4
4	3.82	4.12	4.45	5
5	4.35	4.71	5.14	6
6	4.87	5.28	5.76	7
7	5.39	5.84	6.36	8
8	5.9	6.39	6.93	9
9	6.41	6.93	7.50	10
10	6.92	7.47	8.06	11
15	9.44	10.09	10.77	16
20	11.95	12.67	13.40	21
50	26.98	27.84	28.70	51
100	51.99	52.92	53.84	101

VIII. Complex case

THEOREM 9 (Wirsing, 1961). For any complex number $\xi \notin \mathbb{A}_n$ there exist infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha \in \mathbb{A}_n$ with

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-A},$$

where

$$A = \frac{n}{4} + 1.$$

 $\underline{Method:}$ "Resultant"

In 2000 this result was slightly improved:

$$A = \frac{n}{4} + \lambda_n$$
, where $\lim_{n \to \infty} \lambda_n = \frac{3}{2}$.

Method: "Big Derivative".

Method "Polynomial Staircase": ? ? ?

IX. P-adic case

THEOREM 10 (Morrison, 1978). Let $\xi \in \mathbb{Q}_p$. If $\xi \notin \mathbb{A}_n$, then there are infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha \in \mathbb{A}_n$ with

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-A},$$

where

$$A = \begin{cases} 1 + \sqrt{3} & \text{when } n = 2, \\ \frac{n}{2} + \frac{3}{2} & \text{when } n > 2. \end{cases}$$

THEOREM 11 (Teulié, 2002). If $\xi \notin \mathbb{A}_2$, then there are infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha \in \mathbb{A}_2$ with

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-3}.$$

The second part of Morrison's theorem was also improved:

$$A = \frac{n}{2} + \lambda_n$$
, where $\lim_{n \to \infty} \lambda_n = 3$.

Method: "Big Derivative".

Method "Polynomial Staircase": ? ? ?

X. Two Counter-Examples

1. Simultaneous case.

CONJECTURE. For any two real numbers $\xi_1, \ \xi_2 \not\in \mathbb{A}_n$ there exist infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha_1, \ \alpha_2$ such that

$$\begin{cases} |\xi_1 - \alpha_1| \ll \overline{P}^{-(n+1)/2}, \\ |\xi_2 - \alpha_2| \ll \overline{P}^{-(n+1)/2}, \end{cases}$$

where $P(x) \in \mathbb{Z}[x]$, $P(\alpha_1) = P(\alpha_2) = 0$, deg $P \leq n$. The implicit constant in \ll should depend on ξ_1 , ξ_2 , and n.

COUNTER-EXAMPLE (Roy-Waldschmidt, 2001). For any sufficiently large n there exist real numbers ξ_1 and ξ_2 such that

$$\max\{|\xi_1 - \alpha_1|, |\xi_2 - \alpha_2|\} > |P|^{-3\sqrt{n}}$$

THEOREM 12. For any real numbers $\xi_1, \xi_2 \notin A_n$ at least one of the following assertions is true:

(i) There exist infinitely many algebraic numbers α_1 , α_2 of degree $\leq n$ such that

$$\begin{cases} |\xi_1 - \alpha_1| \ll \overline{P}|^{-\frac{n}{8} - \frac{3}{8}}, \\ |\xi_2 - \alpha_2| \ll \overline{P}|^{-\frac{n}{8} - \frac{3}{8}}. \end{cases}$$

(*ii*) For some $\xi \in \{\xi_1, \xi_2\}$ there exist infinitely many algebraic numbers α of degree $2 \le k \le \frac{n+2}{4}$ such that

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\frac{n+2}{4}-1}$$

2. Approximation by algebraic integers.

THEOREM 13. (Davenport - Schmidt, 1968) Let $n \geq 3$. Let ξ be real, but not algebraic of degree ≤ 2 . Then there are infinitely many algebraic integers α of degree ≤ 3 which satisfy

$$0 < |\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-\eta_3},$$

where

$$\eta_3 = \frac{1}{2}(3 + \sqrt{5}) = 2.618\dots$$

CONJECTURE. Let ξ be real, but is not algebraic of degree $\leq n$. Suppose $\epsilon > 0$. Then there are infinitely many real algebraic integers α of degree $\leq n$ with

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-n+\epsilon}.$$

THEOREM 14 (Roy, 2001). There exist real numbers ξ such that for any algebraic integer α of degree ≤ 3 , we have

$$|\xi - \alpha| \gg H(\alpha)^{-(3/2)\eta_3}.$$

XI. Most Recent Result

THEOREM 15. For any real number $\xi \notin A_3$ there exist infinitely many algebraic numbers $\alpha \in A_3$ such that

$$|\xi - \alpha| \ll H(\alpha)^{-A},$$

where A = 3.7475.. is the largest root of the equation

$$2x^3 - 11x^2 + 11x + 8 = 0.$$